

August 24, 1976

Daniel X. Freedman, M.D.
Chief Editor
Archives of General Psychiatry
Chicago, Illinois

Re: Ms #4024

Dear Dan,

On my return from my holidays, I found your letter of July 26 with the critiques of the paper "*Efficacy and Safety of Induced Seizures (EST) in Man.*" I cannot say that I am surprised, for I have become accustomed to unusually sharp criticism of any report that I write on EST. But I did find many of the comments useful, and taken in the spirit of improving the product, I shall try to correct some of the omissions and the errors, as well as add a section of clear critique of the status of our present knowledge. I do think that the last request is for an additional paper, but perhaps the addition will not be too large and may be useful.

In your letter you indicate that "I have decided my initial reaction is off target - I enclose a letter I wrote; I also enclose Noch Callaway's response." Neither your letter nor Noch's response were in the package, and if you still think these would be useful in re-writing this report, I would be grateful to see them. (I received critiques I to V).

I have some specific questions for reviewer # 2 (begins 'I appreciate the timeliness of this review, esp. . . .'). He argues that the issue of the comparative efficacy and safety of EST vs. antipsychotic and antidepressant drugs is not dealt with ~~well~~ at all. I thought that I have cited the principal articles in this regard; would it be possible to ask whether there are other citations missing? If the criticism is that the presentation is poor, then I accept that criticism and will re-write it; but I do believe I have cited the most relevant articles. I also find his statement 'there are hints of the possibly overly sanguine clinician-enthusiast in some parts' helpful, and have attempted to take a more judicious posture.

In any case, it will take a few weeks of extra-effort, but this means a delay to get the text back to you-- probably early October.

My thanks to your many busy researchers who took the effort to write such fine critiques.

My regards.

Sincerely yours,

Max Fink, M.D.